

Grammar Feedback

The Debate about Error
Correction and How We
Might Proceed

Background

- Truscott (1996) performed meta-analysis of >10 studies
- Conclusion: Grammar correction should be abandoned

Why Abandon Grammar Correction?

- Ineffective: Variety of L1 and L2 studies (Zamel 1985; Hendrickson, 1978)
- Harmful (Kepner, 1991; Sheppard, 1992; Sempke, 1984)
- Uses time better spent

Counterargument

- Ferris (1999, 2004)

Students value it

Intuitive value

More research necessary,

esp. longitudinal

Current Views

- Be selective
- Be appropriate to level
- Be encouraging (not judgmental)
(Larsen-Freeman, 2003)

Recent Research (TESOL 2009)

- Weyrich and Berton, Columbus State Comm. College (2009)

Correction and indicating >
identifying in both
workshop & classroom

Errors--what research tells us (Scovel, Reid)

- Errors are:
 1. Not deviant or random
 2. Systematic, developmental, rule-governed
 3. Result from L1 transfer, overgeneralization, and difficulty

Research on Evaluation/Feedback

- Regular university faculty look for content and rhetorical forms, less to errors, unless latter is egregious
- ESL students, more than NES, want feedback
- Correction + encouragement = results
- Underlining errors = yields most revision from
ESL students

Research on Evaluation/Feedback

- Addressing both content + grammar in feedback won't overwhelm students!
- Feedback without follow up is far less effective
- Delayed feedback is worthless

What to Do

- Do provide content feedback
- Make students aware
- Don't get hung up on it

What to Do

- Be selective, appropriate, encouraging (caveat)
- Provide feedback in timely & time-efficient manner
- Be personal

References

- Ferris, D.R. (1999). The case for grammar correction in L2 writing classes: A response to Truscott (1996). *Journal of Second Language Writing, 8* (1), 1-10.
- Ferris, D.R. (2004). The “grammar correction” debate in L2 writing: Where are we, and where do we go from here? (And what do we do in the meantime....?). *Journal of Second Language Writing, 13*, 49-62.
- Hendrickson, J.M. (1978). Error correction in foreign language teaching: Recent theory, research, and practice. *The Modern Language Journal, 62* (8), 387-398.

References (cont'd)

- Kepner, C.G. (1991). An experiment in the relationship of types of written feedback to the development of second –language writing skills. *Modern Language Journal*, 75, 305-313.
- Larsen-Freeman, D. (2003). *Teaching language: From grammar to grammaring*. Boston: Heinle & Heinle.
- Semke, H.D. (1984). Effects of the red pen. *Foreign Language Annals*, 17, 195-202.

References (cont'd)

- Sheppard, K. (1992). Two feedback types: Do they make a difference? *RELC Journal*, 23, 103-110.
- Truscott, J. (1996). The case against grammar correction in L2 writing classes. *Language Learning*, 46, 327-369.
- Zamel, V. (1985). Responding to student writing. *Tesol Quarterly*, 19 (1), 79-97.

Assessing Student Writing

Grading Rubrics and Feedback Mechanisms

Russ Mason



ELI Writing Skills Check List (Based on TSE guidelines)

V. The student's writing demonstrates general competence both on the rhetorical and syntactic levels, though it will have occasional errors. His/her writing is generally well organized and well developed though it may lack sufficient details; shows unity, coherence, and progression; demonstrates some syntactic variety and range of vocabulary; displays general facility in language; but may address some parts of the task more

General Level V: Writing Objectives

Students will be able to:

1. Develop the ability to write grammatically accurate sentences.
2. Increase the clarity and variety of expression while improving structural accuracy at the sentence, paragraph, and essay level.
3. Write in the following organizational patterns: comparison-contrast, cause and ¹⁷effect, and persuasion

Summary Paragraph: Student Proofreading Checklist

A. Topic and Task

1. Have you followed the teacher's instructions in regard to the topic?
2. Have you adequately addressed the assigned task? (For example, is your composition of the appropriate length? Is it the correct kind of text: e.g., descriptive, narrative, summary, comparison-contrast, cause, effect, expository, or argumentative?)

Summary Paragraph:

Student Proofreading Checklist

C. Grammar, Punctuation, Spelling, and Mechanics

1. Have you proof-read your paper to make sure that all the grammatical structures are accurate?
2. Is your punctuation correct?
3. Did you use lower and upper case (capital) letters correctly?
4. Is your spelling correct?

D. Format

Sample Writing Activity

Steps in the process:

- 1) Read a brief feature story in class.
- 2) Discuss the vocabulary and meaning of the article.
- 3) Identify the four main ideas of the article and list them.
- 4) Discuss special instructions: Include in your topic sentence the title, author's name, and text-type of the original article; be sure to add a concluding sentence

encourage

By Sam Connery

Taking liberties with an American goddess



Topic sentence: the name of the article, the text type of the article, the outlier of the article, the main of the article

Mocked, ^{boke} martyred and ^{besides} marketed, our favorite statue is still hard at work "enlightening the world"

It was, one reporter wrote, like "a hundred Fourths of July"—the air ringing with tugboat whistles, shouts and marching bands. A speech by New York's Senator William Evarts could hardly be heard; when he paused, an impatient crowd burst into applause. Perched high above, inside his 302-foot masterpiece, French sculptor Frédéric-Auguste Bartholdi heard the cheers and prematurely let loose a tricolor veil from the stern face of his creation, Liberty Enlightening the World.

Even before that day in October 1886, the Statue of Liberty was seized upon as a national symbol, more identified with America than Britannia has ever been with Britain or Marianne with France. Bartholdi, showing remarkable foresight, secured the rights to his design—and it surely paid off. Greeting shiploads of new immigrants, Liberty was the obvious choice to illustrate guides to citizenship. On the assumption that patriotism sells (how times have changed!), she was used to pitch products from cigarettes and sewing thread to wafers (opposite) and to urge young men to get into uniform, if only as Boy Scouts (left). She has been saluted and skewered by editorial cartoonists, mocked and martyred, admonished and admired, and even, at times, disrobed (p. 84).

But despite wanton exploitation of the good lady, she remains the potent symbol of American-style freedom and inclusiveness Bartholdi had in mind. In May 1989, pro-democracy demonstrators in China wheeled a 33-foot Styrofoam-and-plaster Liberty into Beijing's Tiananmen Square. Tanks easily ran the "Goddess of Democracy" down—but the hope she represented has proved more durable.

1

2

3

4

French

China in Tiananmen

world

Summary Writing

promote

- Q#1 - The enthusiastic reception of the gift of the ~~statue~~ ^{statue of Liberty}.
- Q#2 - The success of the symbol in the U.S. ^{even before the gift image}
- Q#3 - the uses of the image ^(the image has been used in many ways)
- Q#4 - The symbol is recognized all around the world

Topic Sentences

We often summarize for different audiences and different purposes. For example, a friend asks us to describe a film we have seen, and we briefly tell that friend what the movie was about. Or we explain to our roommate what a terrible vacation we have had by briefly describing the worst parts of that vacation. Or we tell a friend about a story we have read by briefly describing the main ideas in the story.

Summaries are often written rather than spoken. That is, we write a shortened form of a long article by writing just about the main ideas in that article. In addition, titles are often very brief summaries of the paragraphs, essays, or articles that follow. Newspaper headlines are *short* summaries of the newspaper articles that follow. In academic journals, the title of an article is often followed by an **abstract**, which is an academic summary that briefly tells the readers what the research article is about. The **purpose** of these written summaries is to **inform** the reader about the main ideas in the articles that follow and/or to **persuade** the reader to read the whole article.

In each of these cases, the person who is summarizing does not include all the specific details. Instead, that person states the main ideas of, for instance, the film, the terrible vacation, or the article. The summary does not repeat words or phrases; it does not use many adjectives or introductory phrases. A **summary**, then, is a **brief description of the main ideas** or actions. We summarize for someone who has not read (or seen or experienced) the book, article, film, or terrible vacation, that we have read (or seen or experienced). The general purpose of a summary, then, is to give a limited amount of information to a specific audience.

Writing Summaries

Although writing summaries may seem to be an easy task, summary writing is complex. The summary writer must be able:

1. to read the original material well and understand it thoroughly
2. to identify the main ideas
3. to restate these ideas

Moreover, summary writing is both different and similar to the writing you have been practicing in earlier chapters of this book. For example, in some ways, writing summaries is the opposite of drafting an original paragraph. In your own writing, you gather supporting detail and arrange that evidence for your topic sentence. You explain, define, clarify, and illustrate your ideas. In contrast, summary writing contains very little (or no) detail. Instead, you extract the main ideas from someone else's work. However, in one important way, summary writing is similar to writing original paragraphs: summaries are written in your own words. In fact, the most difficult part of writing a summary is accurately stating the main ideas of another person's article without using the exact phrases or sentences of the original material.

Finally, successful summaries are clear and balanced. That is, the reader (or listener) can easily understand the main ideas of the longer material. If the summary is unsuccessful, the reader (or listener) will be confused.

to listen

Please talk with me if you have questions and
Please try again,

D

Capitalize your title
appropriately.

The Symbol of Freedom

5/5/10
RIW V

Comma
space

Be concise in your topic sentence.
What is the text type?

Today, I read an article, and the name of

the article is "Taking liberties with an American goddess," by Sam Connery. It talked about the statue of America

What do you mean?
Clarify your point

Liberty enlightening the world, the background of the statue, made by French sculptor Frederic-Auguste Bartholdi. The American goddess became

Express each of the four main ideas concisely and clearly.

a big success in the U.S. and during that time, people used the image to patriotism, and urged the young people to join the army. Undergo a

Preposition

Verb choice

What do you mean?
Clarify this point?

long process. The symbol is recognized all around the world. It has become an international and inclusiveness, and it make waves in many countries.

What do you mean?

What is your concluding idea?
Your "supporting ideas" will consist of the four main points of the original article. Don't end with a "supporting" sentence.

Reading/Writing General V Teacher: Russ Mason

Tutoring assignment: Verb tenses Take an old essay (i.e., one that has been marked by your teacher) to your tutor and ask him or her to help you correct the verb tense errors.

Students should fill out this form at the end of tutoring. Tutors, please initial the form. Students, please return the signed form to the teacher when you have completed the assignment.

Student Name _____ Tutoring Date 5/10/10

Today we worked on rewriting summary and correcting

Write one or two things that you learned present perfect tense errors.

- Please do:
- ① error analysis
 - ② rewrite summary A

Student signature

Tutor signature

B+ Good work,

**ELI General Level V: Reading/Writing
Summary Paragraph Error Analysis**

5/11/10
R/W V

A. Topic and Task: Count and analyze your errors!

- ✓ 1. Have you followed the teacher's instructions in regard to the topic?
Yes, I have.
- ✓ 2. Have you adequately addressed the assigned task? Did you summarize all of the main points in the original article as we discussed them, omitting the details?
No, I haven't. I omitted some details, and did not make the main

B. Composition: Count and analyze your errors! that I summarized very clearly.

- ✓ 1. Do you have a well-written topic sentence which clearly expresses the main idea and which properly frames the issue? (For example, since this is a summary paragraph, does your topic sentence state the text type (short feature), title (e.g., "Don't fence him in"), the place of publication (*People* magazine), and the main idea of the story?
No, I think my article does not have a well-written topic sentence.
- ✓ 2. Are all of your supporting sentences clearly related to the topic (relevant)?
I think my supporting sentences related to the topic but ~~is~~ not clearly enough.
- OK 3. Are all of the relationships and transitions between ideas clear and coherent?
No, they aren't.
- ⊙ 4. Have you developed the main idea of the paragraph adequately? Is there enough information? Is the paragraph long enough? Is it too long (with too many details)?
No, I haven't. I think there ~~is~~ enough information. It is not too long.
- ⊙ 5. Does the paragraph have a concluding idea that ties together all of the supporting ideas and the topic sentence?
It ~~has~~ a concluding idea. But it ~~does~~ not tie together all of the supporting ideas.

C. Grammar, Punctuation, Spelling, and Mechanics: Count and analyze your errors!

- ✓ 1. Are all the grammatical structures accurate and clear? **Count each type of grammar mistake and list the number of errors in each category** (e.g., 3 errors of prepositions, 2 errors of verb tense, 5 omitted articles, 4 errors of subject-verb agreement, etc.)
3 errors of prepositions, 2 errors of verb tense, 3 errors of sentences meaning.
- ✓ 2. Is your punctuation correct? **Count and analyze the number of errors.**
1 error of punctuation
- ✓ 3. Did you use lower and upper case (capital) letters correctly? **Count your errors.**
2 errors of capital letters
- ✓ 4. Is your spelling correct? **Count and analyze your errors.**
Yes, it is.

D. Format: Count and analyze your errors!

- ✓ 1. Have you written your personal information (name/date-handed-in/class) in the top right-hand corner of your paper? This information should be single-spaced.

C+

Please follow
directions -

Include the title of the
article and the text type in your

topic
sentence. According to Sam Connerly, New York's

The Symbol of Freedom

J/10/10
R/WI

Statue of Liberty has remained a strong

What
about the
first two
main
points?

symbol of American freedom and democracy for

more than 100 years despite many occasions

when the statue was used to sell commercial

products or to attack political enemies in the

press. The French sculptor of the statue,

Frederic-Auguste Barthold, made much money

from selling the rights to use his design.

~~⊗~~ These days, the statue is recognized

around the world by countries as far apart

as Britain and China.

Include a concluding idea. Don't end by summarizing

the author's fourth point.

Grading Rubric for Argumentative Essays
General V Reading/Writing

Name: _____

1) Following instructions (assignment parameters):

Topic ____

Task ____

Format ____

On-time/length ____

2) Content:

Clarity & substance (opinion, main points, cohesion, unity, etc.) ____

Quality & persuasiveness of the argument

Support and development of the main points of the argument ____

3) Composition:

Paragraph &

Essay Structure: ____

Organization:

ARGUMENTATIVE ESSAY GRADING RUBRIC

Area Evaluated	Exemplary: A - B	Competent: B - C	Developing: D - F
Following Instructions, “Rules” and Assignment Parameters	The essay appropriately addresses the assigned task and topic, follows the format guide-lines, and was turned in on time.	The essay only partly addresses the assigned task and/or topic. The essay only partly follows the format guidelines. The essay was turned in one day late.	The essay fails to address the assigned task and/or topic appropriately. The essay fails to follow the format guidelines. The essay was turned in more than one day late.
Content	The writer’s opinion is clearly expressed. A substantive and persuasive argument is developed around the writer’s main points with clear and effective strategies. Ideas are developed with sufficient depth and completeness, strong support, and adequate detail.	The writer’s opinion is expressed in a vague (unclear) way. The argument lacks depth and persuasiveness. Supporting evidence and analyses are lacking in detail (are sketchy). Main points, supporting details, and relationships are unclear. Argumentative strategies are employed but are not effective.	The writer’s opinion and main ideas are poorly identified or not identified. The writer’s supporting argument is weak or nonexistent. The argument lacks depth and detail and is not persuasive. Strategies of development or not well employed or are unidentifiable. Only general statements are made; no analysis or supporting details are provided. The essay is incomplete.
Organization and Composition	The thesis statement clearly expressed the writer’s opinion and main organizational points. Writing shows a unified and consistent organization. All paragraphs are well composed and organized with topic sentences relating to main points. The order and structure of the essay, paragraphs, and sentences are compelling and move the reader through the text easily.	The thesis statement is weak or does not express the main organizational points clearly. The writing demonstrates a logical order and structure that may be formulaic or inconsistent. Paragraphs, sentences, and transitions between ideas are sometimes effective but sometimes not. Some elements of composition at the essay level and/or at the paragraph level are weak or missing (i.e., topic sentences, supporting ideas, concluding ideas, summary statement, etc.). The conclusion is only partly effective and may or may not build to a climax.	The thesis statement does not appear, appears in the wrong place, is weak or incoherent, or does not mention the main organizational points. The structure of the introductory paragraph is wrong or does not move from general to specific in a well-coordinated way. The body paragraphs lack topic sentences related to the main points, lack well-ordered support, or lack concluding ideas. The concluding paragraph lacks a summary statement or an effective concluding idea. The essay and/or paragraphs lack cohesion and/or unity.
Conventions	The title is correctly presented. The grammar, spelling, punctuation, and vocabulary usage are correct and appropriate. The tone is consistent and appropriate to the assignment.	There are some errors of grammar, spelling, punctuation, and capital letters, but the reader can at least understand the main ideas. Vocabulary is not always used appropriately. The tone is inconsistent and/or inappropriate.	Errors of grammar and syntax are so serious that the reader cannot understand the essay. There are many errors of spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Major flaws and/or inappropriate vocabulary usage impede readability. The tone is wildly inconsistent and/or inappropriate.

Writing Assessment Rubric for Entering Level V

5. The rater can expect to see a relatively organized and coherent essay that may contain serious errors that affect meaning. The essay should have details which support a main idea or illustrate ideas. It should also demonstrate some facility with word usage and form. The essay should contain a variety of sentence types (e.g. simple, compound, complex) The essay should also demonstrate the following:
- An understanding of the tense/aspect system, although some errors in form or function may be present.
 - Incorporation of Level IV grammar features such as the use of modals, adjective clauses, adverb clauses and noun clauses. **This list should not be considered a checklist.** However, it is unlikely that a student would be able to adequately address the task without level four grammar.
 - Multi-paragraph format including introduction and thesis statement, body, and conclusion. However, the writer might not finish the conclusion within the allotted time.
 - A response to a written prompt with minimal oral explanation that addresses the task in an adequate, if not thorough, way.

Writing Assessment Rubric for Entering Level VI

6. The rater can expect to see a well-organized and well-developed essay that may contain occasional errors in syntax, usage, word form, mechanics and spelling. An essay at this level should demonstrate facility in expressing ideas on both familiar and new topics. The essay should demonstrate the following:
- Accurate use of easier vocabulary and the inclusion of some more advanced vocabulary. The more advanced vocabulary may be used inappropriately or incorrectly at times.
 - A variety of sentence types including complex sentences.
 - Incorporation of Level V grammar features such as reduced adjective and adverb clauses (adjective and adverbial phrases), accurate use of the passive voice, use of modal perfects, and verbals (gerunds and infinitives). **This list should not be considered a checklist.** However, it is unlikely that a student would be able to adequately address the task without using structures taught in level five grammar lessons.
 - Multi-paragraph format (a minimum of four) with adequate organization including an introduction with thesis statement, body paragraphs which support the thesis and a conclusion . However, the writer might not finish within the allotted time.

General Level V

Writing

